

RFQ # 1011679 - Pilot Plant Study for K.R. Harrington Water Treatment Plant

Offeror	CDM Smith	Gresham Smith & Partners	K G Harrison & Associates
Qualifications and Experience (55 Points)	40.00	40.00	25.00
Study Approach (35 Points)	30.00	28.00	20.00
Organizational Capacity (10 Points)	7.00	8.00	5.00
Total Evaluation Scores	77.00	76.00	50.00

CDM Smith

Strengths – Project Manager demonstrated expertise in four (4) lead water pilot plant studies; strong overall prime and technical review committee experience; Prime had lots of pilot plant study experience; detailed narrative with holistic team approach; custom built system; provided several proposed treatment technologies; and inside Davidson County

Weaknesses – lack of team members past experience working together; water research experience lack detail; client manager demonstrated waste water experience; lack of department technical review;; didn't mention coupon sampling; failed to address SCADA system; and availability

Gresham Smith & Partners

Strengths – Existing in depth knowledge of K.R. Harrington WTP which reduces learning curve; pilot plant experience of sub-consultant; four project managers 100% availability; suggested coupon testing; and inside Davidson County

Weaknesses – No prime team member with pilot plan study experience; university staff proposed as technical specialist; organizational team structure; proposal difficult to follow; Ozone Approach rather than requested holistic approach; proposed only bench scale testing for UV; Omohundro mentioned throughout approach; hydrogen peroxide proposed as seasonal rather than a full 12 months; Project Manager did not demonstrated any pilot plant experience; did not include sampling plan; failed to address QA/QC; included and referenced links to outside documents in study approach which exceeded page limit of section; and failed to provide description and title under capacity

K G Harrison & Associates

Strengths – Inside Davidson County; Project Manager has in depth knowledge of K.R. Harrington WTP; and plan to simulate distribution system testing.

Weaknesses – Prime lacked pilot plant experience; Prime lacked capacity compared to other proposing firms; and availability of key technical members